Official ITA Team Match Protest Ruling

Division & Gender: Division II Women  Date of Match: 3/13/18

Match: Augustana University vs University of Tampa

Team Protesting: Augustana University

Ruling Committee: Division II Women’s National Ranking Committee

Protest Summary:

The ITA Women's Division II National Ranking Committee has thoroughly reviewed the line-up protest statement submitted by Coach Marc Kurtz (Augustana) regarding his match against the University of Tampa on March 13, 2018, as well as the subsequent defense statement submitted by Coach Al Dufaux (Tampa).

The Committee has ruled that the University of Tampa did violate ITA Rule I.E.4 (lineup changes in back-to-back dual matches, Page 4 of the 2017-18 ITA Rulebook) at lines 1-4 singles. In her most recent match prior to the match in question (February 13 vs Eckerd College), Emily Hewland played at the #5 singles position, directly behind Dorsey and multiple spots behind Iordanova and Nice. In her next match, against Augustana on March 13, she was moved to #1 singles, ahead of three players she played behind on February 13 (Iordanova, Nice & Dorsey). This is a clear violation of ITA Rule I.E.4. According to ITA Rule I.E.4, the highest position she would have been able to play on March 13 was #4 singles, ahead of Dorsey but behind Stephens, Iordanova and Nice.

Furthermore, the committee ruled that ITA Rule I.E.10 (placement of ill or injured players in the line-up) is not applicable to this situation. Although the time between Ms. Hewland’s singles matches was greater than three weeks and due to injury, Ms. Hewland competed in doubles during that time, negating this rule.

As a result of this ruling, the lines in question will be awarded to Augustana resulting in a 5-4 win for Augustana University.

The Committee felt strongly that the “one position move” rule is one of the most widely known and important principles in the setting of a collegiate tennis lineup. The Committee stressed that at if at any time a coach feels his/her lineup is out of order, that coach should move the player(s) in question to the correct lineup position or in the direction of the correct lineup position one position at a time in accordance with ITA Rule I.E.4.

The “Order of Ability” question was not decided as the committee felt that the correct application of ITA Rule I.E.4 would have left Ms. Hewland in an appropriate position in the singles lineup (#4) with respect to “order of ability.” The Committee would note that at this point in time and based on available match data, placement of Ms. Hewland any higher than #4 could leave the University of Tampa susceptible to future protests. Coach Dufaux should use his best judgement, based on available match data, in his placement of Ms. Hewland moving forward.

As the individual matches in question were played in good faith, the singles match results will be allowed to stand but the overall match score will be adjusted to a 5-4 win for Augustana. The ITA office will make
this adjustment in the ITA Results Entry System. The individual programs involved are instructed to make the appropriate adjustment to their institutional websites.

Please note that decisions made by the ITA Division II National Ranking Committee are final and no appeals will be accepted. Please also be aware that ITA policy does not permit coaches to contact committee members before or after a protest decision is made to question this decision or ask for additional information.